Project Group "DynaSearch" Final Presentation



Table of Contents

Introduction

- Objective Function Search in P2P Networks
 - Introduction
 - Algorithms
 - Experimental Results
 - Further Results & Conclusion
- 3 Network Creation Processes
 - Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests
 - Node Swap Processes
 - Shortcut Process
 - Open Problems

Introduction

Project Group



Our Work in the CRC 901

Big software from small pieces – Search for pieces that

- Maximize some objective function or
- Fulfill certain properties
- Ommunicating entities with varying interests
 - Adapt network to these interests

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Objective Function Search in P2P Networks

Introduction

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Motivation

- Data items have several attributes
- Scenario: User specifies what is important to him
- Does not know which items exist
- Wants best possible result

Introduction

Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Formal Definition

General:

- Data items in $[0,1)^d$
- Request is function $f:[0,1)^d \to \mathbb{R}$

For now:

- *d* = 2
- f is linear: $f(x, y) := a_1x + a_2y$

Introduction

Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Example



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

First Idea

- Move sweep line through coordinate space
- Start at best corner
- Result is first item found

What do we need?

- Manage coordinate space in p2p system
- Efficient way of searching

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Basic P2P System

- Use Content Addressable Network (CAN)
- Manages data items in $[0,1)^d$ coordinate space
- Each node responsible for section of space

CAN Example



Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

How to search?

- Many data items \Rightarrow Result at corner
- Few data items \Rightarrow Large empty sections
- Want to skip empty sections quickly
- \Rightarrow Meta structure with containment information

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Hierarchy Meta Structure

- Create tree structure with containment information
- Root node responsible for whole coordinate space
- Partition recursively
- Node knows whether some child contains data item



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Network Balance

Need to make some assumptions about network structure:



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Network Balance

Introduce *c-balance*:

- s := shortest side length of any CAN-area
- $\ell :=$ longest side length of any CAN-area
- $c := \frac{\ell^2}{s^2}$

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Objective Function Search in P2P Networks

Algorithms

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Algorithm FINDMAX Basic Idea

- Approach
 - Start at root of hierarchy
 - If area contains data item: search child areas; else: skip area

Technique

- Sequentially process areas
- Best areas are processed first
- Areas with higher hierarchy level are preferred

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Algorithm FINDMAX Illustration



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Algorithm FINDMAX Illustration



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Algorithm FINDMAX Analysis – Results & Techniques

- Scenario: n node c-balanced CAN, linear objective function
- Message count: $\mathcal{O}(c^{3/2} \cdot \sqrt{n})$
- Response time: $\mathcal{O}(c^{3/2} \cdot \sqrt{n})$
- Technique:
 - Line ℓ_p through optimal result p
 - Algorithm contacts non-empty areas intersecting ℓ_p
 - Upper bound number of intersecting areas using balance factor *c*

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

$\begin{array}{l} \textbf{Algorithm} \ \overline{F} \text{IND} MAX \\ \textbf{Analysis} - \textbf{Results} \ \& \ \textbf{Techniques} \end{array}$



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Algorithm PARAMAX Basic Idea

- Lower bound function value of result
- Ø Multiple iterations; each time increase lower bound
- Substant A state of the stat
- Process areas in parallel

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Algorithm PARAMAX Illustration



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Algorithm PARAMAX Illustration



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Algorithm PARAMAX Illustration


Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Algorithm PARAMAX Illustration



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Algorithm PARAMAX



Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Algorithm PARAMAX Analysis – Results & Techniques

- Scenario: n node c-balanced CAN, linear objective function
- Message count: $\mathcal{O}(\sqrt{c \cdot n})$
- Response time: $\mathcal{O}((\log c)^2 + (\log n)^2)$
- Techniques:
 - For each hierarchy level: stripes of contacted areas from that level
 - Upper bound number of areas in each stripe using balance factor *c*

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Objective Function Search in P2P Networks

Experimental Results

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Experimental Results

- Setting: 1000 Nodes, 100 Data Items, 1000 Requests, 25 runs
- Analyze the balance factor c
- Analyze the influence of different scaling factors:
 - Request angle
 - Number nodes

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Balance Factor



Balance factor by number nodes

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Influence of Request Angle



Performance of $\operatorname{FIND}\operatorname{MAX}$ by request angle

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Scaling of Response Time



Response time by number nodes

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Scaling of Message Count / Number Nodes



Message count of $\operatorname{FINDMAX}$ by number nodes

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Scaling of Message Count / Number Nodes



Message count of $\operatorname{PARAMAX}$ by number nodes

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Objective Function Search in P2P Networks

Further Results & Conclusion

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Further Results

- Algorithms can be applied to higher dimensions
 - Bad scaling of worst cases
- Work for convex functions with minor modifications
 - Similar performance in experiments
 - No theoretical results

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Conclusion

- Good first approach to function search
- Tree structure leads to balance problems
- Balance factor (of network) does not matter
- Theoretical worst cases on algorithm behavior happen in practice

Introduction Algorithms Experimental Results Further Results & Conclusion

Outlook

- Observe: Possible results are from convex hull of data items
- Approach: Construct meta structure managing convex hull

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Network Creation Processes

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Network Creation Games

Classical notion:

- n agents
- A strategy for every agent
- Costs for every agent depending on strategy
- Nash Equilibria

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Network Creation Games

Classical notion:

- n agents
- A strategy for every agent
- Costs for every agent depending on strategy
- Nash Equilibria

Recent developement:

- One-shot games with direct equilibria
- Investigate convergence of processes
- Our contribution: investigate sequence of processes

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Network Creation Processes

Definition

A network creation process on a node set V consists of:

1 Initial undirected graph G_0



Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Network Creation Processes

Definition

A network creation process on a node set V consists of:

- **1** Initial undirected graph G_0
- 2 Set of undirected friendships F

F(v) denotes the friends of $v \in V$



Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Network Creation Processes

Definition

A network creation process on a node set V consists of:

- **1** Initial undirected graph G_0
- Set of undirected friendships F F(v) denotes the friends of v ∈ V

3 Costs of
$$v \in V$$
 in $G: c_G(v) = \sum_{u \in F(v)} d_G(u, v)$ or $c_G(v) = \max_{u \in F(v)} d_G(u, v)$



Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Network Creation Processes

Definition

A network creation process on a node set V consists of:

- **1** Initial undirected graph G_0
- ② Set of undirected friendships F F(v) denotes the friends of v ∈ V
- 3 Costs of $v \in V$ in G: $c_G(v) = \sum_{u \in F(v)} d_G(u, v)$ or $c_G(v) = \max_{u \in F(v)} d_G(u, v)$
- Game operation: How nodes can transform the current graph, e.g., a node can swap position with one of its neighbors



Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

4

Network Creation Processes

Definition

A network creation process on a node set V consists of:

- **1** Initial undirected graph G_0
- ② Set of undirected friendships F F(v) denotes the friends of v ∈ V
- Costs of $v \in V$ in G: $c_G(v) = \sum_{u \in F(v)} d_G(u, v)$ or $c_G(v) = \max_{u \in F(v)} d_G(u, v)$
- Game operation: How nodes can transform the current graph, e.g., a node can swap position with one of its neighbors
- Strategy: Which operations a node is allowed to perform, e.g., a node can perform a swap iff its costs decrease

1 can swap with 2, but not with 4 (3)

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Network Creation Processes

Definition

A network creation process on a node set V consists of:

- **1** Initial undirected graph G_0
- ② Set of undirected friendships F F(v) denotes the friends of v ∈ V
- Costs of $v \in V$ in G: $c_G(v) = \sum_{u \in F(v)} d_G(u, v)$ or $c_G(v) = \max_{u \in F(v)} d_G(u, v)$



- Strategy: Which operations a node is allowed to perform, e.g., a node can perform a swap iff its costs decrease
- Move policy: Node order to perform operations

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Reachable Network Creation Processes

Idea: Communication interests can vary \Rightarrow Observe influence of simple dynamics

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Reachable Network Creation Processes

Idea: Communication interests can vary

 \Rightarrow Observe influence of simple dynamics

Definition

A network creation process is reachable if it can be built up by

- starting with the empty friendship set, and
- adding exactly one new friendship every time a Nash equilibrium is reached.





Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Equilibria

Definition

Consider a network creation process.

- A graph is a *Nash equilibrium (NE)* if no node can perform a game operation according to the strategy.
- A graph is an operation equilibrium (OE) if
 - it is a Nash equilibrium, and
 - it can be reached from the initial graph according to the game operation.
- A graph is a process equilibrium (PE) if
 - it is an operation equilibrium, and
 - it can be reached from the initial graph according to the strategy and the move policy.



Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Network Creation Processes

Node Swap Processes

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Convergence: SNSP

Definition

A network creation process is a Selfish Node Swap Process (SNSP) if

- game operation: a node can swap with one of its neighbors
- strategy: a node can perform exactly those swaps that decrease its costs

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Convergence: SNSP

Definition

A network creation process is a Selfish Node Swap Process (SNSP) if

- game operation: a node can swap with one of its neighbors
- strategy: a node can perform exactly those swaps that decrease its costs

Theorem

For any connected graph G = (V, E) with diameter ≥ 2 , there is a reachable SNSP with G as initial graph and the maximum cost function for which no OE exists. This also holds for the average cost function.

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Convergence: WPNSP

Definition

A network creation process is a *Weak Pairwise Node Swap Process (WPNSP)* if

- game operation: a node can swap with one of its neighbors
- strategy: a node can perform exactly those swaps that decrease its own costs and do not increase the costs of the swap partner

Node Swap Processes

Convergence: WPNSP

Definition

A network creation process is a Weak Pairwise Node Swap Process (WPNSP) if

- game operation: a node can swap with one of its neighbors
- strategy: a node can perform exactly those swaps that decrease its own costs and do not increase the costs of the swap partner

Definition

A move policy is *improving* if it always chooses one of the nodes that can perform a game operation according to the strategy.



Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Convergence: WPNSP – AVE

Theorem

Consider a WPNSP with initial graph G, set of friendships F, the average cost function and an improving move policy. Then it reaches a PE after at most |F|(diam(G) - 1) steps.

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Convergence: WPNSP – AVE

Theorem

Consider a WPNSP with initial graph G, set of friendships F, the average cost function and an improving move policy. Then it reaches a PE after at most |F|(diam(G) - 1) steps.

Lemma

For every $d \in \mathbb{N}$, $d \ge 3$, there is a reachable WPNSP with initial graph G with diameter $\Theta(d)$, $\Theta(d)$ friendships F, the average cost function and an improving move policy that reaches a PE in $\Theta(|F|(\text{diam}(G) - 1) \text{ steps.})$

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Convergence: WPNSP – AVE

Lemma

For every $d \in \mathbb{N}$, $d \ge 3$, there is a reachable WPNSP with initial graph G with diameter $\Theta(d)$, $\Theta(d)$ friendships F, the average cost function and an improving move policy that reaches a PE in $\Theta(|F|(\text{diam}(G) - 1) \text{ steps.})$



Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Convergence: WPNSP – MAX

Lemma

There is a reachable WPNSP with the maximum cost function that has no PE even if its move policy is arbitrarily changed.



Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Convergence: SPNSP

Definition

A network creation process is a *Strong Pairwise Node Swap Process (SPNSP)* if

- game operation: a node can swap with one of its neighbors
- strategy: a node can perform exactly those swaps that decrease its own costs as well as the costs of the swap partner
Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Convergence: SPNSP

Definition

A network creation process is a *Strong Pairwise Node Swap Process (SPNSP)* if

- game operation: a node can swap with one of its neighbors
- strategy: a node can perform exactly those swaps that decrease its own costs as well as the costs of the swap partner

Theorem

Every SPNSP with the maximum cost function and an improving move policy reaches always a PE.

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processe Shortcut Process Open Problems

Overview

	SNSP	WPNSP		SPNSP		
	AVE MAX	AVE	МАХ	AVE	MAX	
Existence of OE	no	yes	open	yes		
Existence of PE	no	yes	no	yes		
Always convergence	no	yes	no	yes		
Convergence speed	∞	$\Theta(F \operatorname{diam}(G))$	∞	$\Theta(F \operatorname{diam}(G))$	$\Omega(V_F ^2 \operatorname{diam}(G))$	
					$O\left(\left(\begin{array}{c} V_F +\operatorname{diam}(G)-1\\ V_F \end{array} ight) ight)$	

$$V_F := \{ v \in V \mid F(v) \neq \emptyset \}$$

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Quality of OE

Definition

Consider a network creation process on a node set V.

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Quality of OE

Definition

Consider a network creation process on a node set V.

- The social costs of a graph G are $sc(G) := \sum_{v \in V} c_G(v)$.
- A graph *G* that can be reached from the initial graph according to the game operation is a *social optimum* if it has lowest social costs among all those graphs.

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Quality of OE

Definition

Consider a network creation process on a node set V.

- The social costs of a graph G are $sc(G) := \sum_{v \in V} c_G(v)$.
- A graph *G* that can be reached from the initial graph according to the game operation is a *social optimum* if it has lowest social costs among all those graphs.
- The operational Price of Anarchy (oPoA) is

$$\frac{\max\{\operatorname{sc}(G) \mid G \text{ OE }\}}{\operatorname{sc}(H)}$$

and the operational Price of Stability (oPoS) is

$$\frac{\min\{\operatorname{sc}(G) \mid G \text{ OE }\}}{\operatorname{sc}(H)}$$

where H is a social optimum.

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Overview

	SNSP WPNSF		P		SPNSP	
	AVE MAX	AVE	MAX	AVE	MAX	
Existence of OE	no	yes	open	yes		
Existence of PE	no	yes	no	yes		
Always convergence	no	yes	no	yes		
Convergence speed	∞	$\Theta(F \operatorname{diam}(G))$	∞	$\Theta(F \operatorname{diam}(G))$	$\Omega(V_F ^2 \operatorname{diam}(G))$	
					$O\left(\left(\begin{array}{c} V_F + \operatorname{diam}(G) - 1\\ V_F \end{array}\right)\right)$	
oPoA	$\Theta(\operatorname{diam}(G))$	$\Theta(\operatorname{diam}(G))$		$\Theta(\operatorname{diam}(G))$		
oPoS	$\Theta(\operatorname{diam}(G))$	1	$\Theta(\operatorname{diam}(G))$	1	O(diam(G))	

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Quality of OE: oPoA for WPNSPs

Theorem

Consider a WPNSP with initial graph G, a non-empty friendship set and the maximum or average cost function that has some OE. Then, oPoA ≤ diam(G).

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Quality of OE: oPoA for WPNSPs

Theorem

- Consider a WPNSP with initial graph G, a non-empty friendship set and the maximum or average cost function that has some OE. Then, oPoA ≤ diam(G).
- Proceeding of the provided and the set of the set



Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Layered Graphs

Layers are cliques and the edges between neighboring layers build a perfect matching or a complete bipartite graph.



Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Overview

	SNSP		WPN	SP	SPNSP		
	AVE	MAX	AVE	MAX	AVE	MAX	
Existence of OE	no		yes	open	yes		
Existence of PE	no		yes	no	yes		
Always convergence	no		yes	no	yes		
Convergence speed	∞		$\Theta(F \operatorname{diam}(G))$	∞	$\Theta(F \operatorname{diam}(G))$	$\Omega(V_F ^2 \operatorname{diam}(G))$	
						$O\left(\left(egin{array}{cc} V_F + \operatorname{diam}(G) - 1 \ V_F \end{array} ight) ight)$	
oPoA							
General graphs	$\overline{\Theta}(\operatorname{diam}(\overline{G}))$		$\Theta(\operatorname{diam}(G))$		$\Theta(\operatorname{diam}(G))$		
Layered graphs	$\Theta(\operatorname{diam}(\overline{G}))$	$\Theta(\sqrt{\operatorname{diam}(G)})$					
oPoS	$\Theta(\operatorname{diam}(G))$		1	$\Theta(\text{diam}(G))$	1	$O(\operatorname{diam}(G))$	

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

NP-completeness

Definition

An OE G is optimal if $sc(G) = min\{sc(H) \mid H \text{ OE}\}.$

Theorem

The problem of finding an optimal OE for a SNSP, WPNSP or SPNSP with the maximum or the average cost function is NP-complete. This also holds for the problem of finding a social optimum.

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

NP-completeness

Definition

An OE G is optimal if $sc(G) = min\{sc(H) \mid H \text{ OE}\}.$

Theorem

The problem of finding an optimal OE for a SNSP, WPNSP or SPNSP with the maximum or the average cost function is NP-complete. This also holds for the problem of finding a social optimum.

- Reduction uses clique problem.
- There is a solutions where all friendships have distance 1 iff friendship graph is isomorphic to a subgraph of the initial graph.
 ⇒ Node swap processes are game theoretical version of subgraph problems.

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Network Creation Processes

Shortcut Process

Definition

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Definition

Consider a network creation process. A *shortcut* of node v is an undirected edge containing v that is not contained in the initial graph and that is owned by v.

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Inter Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Definition

Definition

Consider a network creation process. A *shortcut* of node v is an undirected edge containing v that is not contained in the initial graph and that is owned by v.

Definition

A network creation process is a Shortcut Process (SCP) if

- game operation: a node can choose a (new) shortcut
- strategy: a node can choose exactly those shortcuts that decrease its costs

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Theoretical Results

Lemma

Consider an SCP, an initial graph with diameter 2 which is an OE and the maximum or average cost function. After starting a new process with an improving move policy by adding a new friendship, this process reaches a PE after at most 1 step.

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Theoretical Results

Lemma

Consider an SCP, an initial graph with diameter 2 which is an OE and the maximum or average cost function. After starting a new process with an improving move policy by adding a new friendship, this process reaches a PE after at most 1 step.

Theorem

The problem of finding an optimal OE for an SCP is NP-complete for both the average and the maximum cost function.

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Theoretical Results

Lemma

Consider an SCP, an initial graph with diameter 2 which is an OE and the maximum or average cost function. After starting a new process with an improving move policy by adding a new friendship, this process reaches a PE after at most 1 step.

Theorem

The problem of finding an optimal OE for an SCP is NP-complete for both the average and the maximum cost function.

Lemma

There is an algorithm that approximates social optima with factor < 2 for SCPs with the average cost function. This also holds for the maximum cost function.

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Simulations

Instance: Sequence of SCPs with

- circle as initial graph,
- a new friendship every time a PE is reached,
- the empty friendship graph in the first SCP until the complete friendship graph in the last SCP,
- the strategy restricted such that every node has to perform a best move,
- o cyclic move policy

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process Open Problems

Simulations

Instance: Sequence of SCPs with

- circle as initial graph,
- a new friendship every time a PE is reached,
- the empty friendship graph in the first SCP until the complete friendship graph in the last SCP,
- the strategy restricted such that every node has to perform a best move,
- o cyclic move policy

Outcome: In every simulated sequence

- all processes reached a PE,
- a huge star was created,
- the social costs of every PE was at most 4 times the social costs of a social optimum.

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process **Open Problems**

Network Creation Processes

Open Problems

Network Creation under Dynamic Communication Interests Node Swap Processes Shortcut Process **Open Problems**

Open Problems

- Fill out Node Swap Table using only reachable examples.
- Proof analog results for SCPs.
- Find characterizations of initial graph or friendship set that imply better convergence behavior or better quality of equilibria (cf., layered graphs).
- Consider more complex dynamics of friendships (e.g., deletion).
- Examine dynamic friendships in other network creation games.